



CONSILIENCE THE PROBLEM

LARRY DOSSEY



**SOCIETY
FOR
SCIENTIFIC
EXPLORATION**

1
00:00:04,460 --> 00:00:02,000
so without an introduction you can read

2
00:00:07,849 --> 00:00:04,470
us by Oh everybody knows Larry Larry's

3
00:00:10,129 --> 00:00:07,859
job really simple I said Larry contacted

4
00:00:15,709 --> 00:00:10,139
him some months ago no pressure

5
00:00:20,929 --> 00:00:15,719
can you define the problem for us and he

6
00:00:25,150 --> 00:00:20,939
said damn you but the answer is yes so I

7
00:00:25,160 --> 00:00:37,000
[Applause]

8
00:00:43,610 --> 00:00:39,770
that is one of the most interesting

9
00:00:45,860 --> 00:00:43,620
introductions I've ever had it's really

10
00:00:53,180 --> 00:00:45,870
very zen the introduction of no

11
00:00:55,490 --> 00:00:53,190
introduction thank you bill well I'm

12
00:00:59,890 --> 00:00:55,500
here partially to pay my respects to

13
00:01:05,660 --> 00:00:59,900

Edward Wilson who introduced this term

14

00:01:06,590 --> 00:01:05,670

to the culture in 1998 he's a Harvard

15

00:01:10,120 --> 00:01:06,600

man he is

16

00:01:15,730 --> 00:01:10,130

one of the world's leading experts and

17

00:01:18,350 --> 00:01:15,740

murmur ecology I didn't know either a

18

00:01:23,450 --> 00:01:18,360

murmur ecologist is an expert in the

19

00:01:26,350 --> 00:01:23,460

study of ants ants in addition he's an

20

00:01:30,260 --> 00:01:26,360

expert in the fields of sociobiology

21

00:01:33,680 --> 00:01:30,270

ecology biodiversity environmentalism

22

00:01:36,980 --> 00:01:33,690

and scientific humanism and besides that

23

00:01:40,309 --> 00:01:36,990

he's won two Pulitzer Prizes here was a

24

00:01:43,279 --> 00:01:40,319

comment from Professor Wilson which

25

00:01:45,910 --> 00:01:43,289

gives you his measure look closely at

26

00:01:48,680 --> 00:01:45,920

nature each species is a masterpiece

27

00:01:51,080 --> 00:01:48,690

excuse me adapted to the particular

28

00:01:53,980 --> 00:01:51,090

environment in which it has survived who

29

00:01:57,440 --> 00:01:53,990

are we to destroy or even diminish

30

00:02:01,040 --> 00:01:57,450

biodiversity well I don't know anyone

31

00:02:03,620 --> 00:02:01,050

who could argue with that so I want at

32

00:02:06,440 --> 00:02:03,630

the outset to acknowledge that I think

33

00:02:09,770 --> 00:02:06,450

that dr. Wilson's motivations are

34

00:02:12,470 --> 00:02:09,780

entirely Noble in spite of the criticism

35

00:02:15,500 --> 00:02:12,480

I shall engage in and I think that his

36

00:02:17,449 --> 00:02:15,510

opinions ought to be respected but this

37

00:02:20,600 --> 00:02:17,459

does not mean that they should not be

38

00:02:23,510 --> 00:02:20,610

questioned he is not the individual who

39

00:02:27,320 --> 00:02:23,520

introduced this term to Western cultures

40

00:02:31,460 --> 00:02:27,330

the term originated in the mid 19th

41

00:02:35,059 --> 00:02:31,470

century and it comes from the Latin Cohn

42

00:02:39,949 --> 00:02:35,069

meaning together and the Latin sealians

43

00:02:42,770 --> 00:02:39,959

meaning jumping so he defines conciliate

44

00:02:45,260 --> 00:02:42,780

as literally a jumping together of

45

00:02:48,650 --> 00:02:45,270

knowledge now the linking of

46

00:02:50,420 --> 00:02:48,660

and fact-based theory across disciplines

47

00:02:54,680 --> 00:02:50,430

to create a common groundwork of

48

00:02:57,290 --> 00:02:54,690

explanation and so Concilium siz

49

00:03:00,110 --> 00:02:57,300

therefore the principle that evidence

50

00:03:02,390 --> 00:03:00,120

from unrelated sources especially

51
00:03:05,030 --> 00:03:02,400
science and the humanities including

52
00:03:07,820 --> 00:03:05,040
literature art philosophy religion music

53
00:03:10,940 --> 00:03:07,830
history and so forth can converge and

54
00:03:13,090 --> 00:03:10,950
produce unified conclusions there's a

55
00:03:15,650 --> 00:03:13,100
more general definition which I like

56
00:03:18,020 --> 00:03:15,660
conceal Ian's involves the conviction

57
00:03:20,330 --> 00:03:18,030
that there is a deep fundamental unity

58
00:03:22,760 --> 00:03:20,340
that connects the seemingly disparate

59
00:03:27,980 --> 00:03:22,770
things of the world now when his book

60
00:03:29,510 --> 00:03:27,990
came out in 1998 I had an early read of

61
00:03:32,090 --> 00:03:29,520
it and I thought this is just terrific

62
00:03:34,580 --> 00:03:32,100
it's about time somebody did something

63
00:03:37,520 --> 00:03:34,590

with this unification of apparently

64

00:03:39,650 --> 00:03:37,530

disparate areas of knowledge well the

65

00:03:44,270 --> 00:03:39,660

culture sort of jumped on this with open

66

00:03:46,880 --> 00:03:44,280

arms and everything is named conciliate

67

00:03:48,890 --> 00:03:46,890

seized days there's a great winery

68

00:03:50,210 --> 00:03:48,900

incentive the Santa Barbara area in

69

00:03:55,310 --> 00:03:50,220

California where you can buy your

70

00:03:58,850 --> 00:03:55,320

conceal Ian's pinot noir Xerox has a

71

00:03:59,750 --> 00:03:58,860

company called conciliate software their

72

00:04:02,500 --> 00:03:59,760

conciliate

73

00:04:07,550 --> 00:04:02,510

technologies there are any number of

74

00:04:11,150 --> 00:04:07,560

consulting groups that have have grabbed

75

00:04:15,940 --> 00:04:11,160

this this name if you're into jazz you

76
00:04:19,220 --> 00:04:15,950
can buy a new album by Vincent Vega jazz

77
00:04:23,180 --> 00:04:19,230
musician named conciliate if you're into

78
00:04:25,130 --> 00:04:23,190
art check out lisa Wohlers through

79
00:04:29,720 --> 00:04:25,140
website she has a new painting called

80
00:04:34,250 --> 00:04:29,730
conceal lan's you can get your frosty

81
00:04:36,710 --> 00:04:34,260
coffee mugs off the internet got conceal

82
00:04:40,400 --> 00:04:36,720
lan's and you can even buy consilience

83
00:04:42,920 --> 00:04:40,410
coffee to go with your coffee and mug so

84
00:04:45,580 --> 00:04:42,930
you know they're just no end to how the

85
00:04:47,750 --> 00:04:45,590
egg culture is embraced of this idea I

86
00:04:50,480 --> 00:04:47,760
find it interesting to go back in

87
00:04:54,140 --> 00:04:50,490
history and look for Concilium spree

88
00:04:56,840 --> 00:04:54,150

cursors I think they're everywhere I

89

00:04:58,850 --> 00:04:56,850

think that the central message from

90

00:05:02,350 --> 00:04:58,860

Buddhism and Daoism

91

00:05:05,180 --> 00:05:02,360

is a form of this Concilium operation

92

00:05:06,970 --> 00:05:05,190

speaking of the complementarity of yin

93

00:05:10,040 --> 00:05:06,980

and yang the feminine of the masculine

94

00:05:12,110 --> 00:05:10,050

reactive in the positive and all of

95

00:05:12,950 --> 00:05:12,120

these things prefigure this idea of

96

00:05:16,190 --> 00:05:12,960

conciliation

97

00:05:18,610 --> 00:05:16,200

well the Greeks were early on into this

98

00:05:22,430 --> 00:05:18,620

idea this is attributed to Homer a

99

00:05:26,690 --> 00:05:22,440

single era is easily broken but not ten

100

00:05:29,990 --> 00:05:26,700

and a bundle there are all sorts of

101
00:05:32,270 --> 00:05:30,000
aphorisms and folk sayings that point to

102
00:05:36,110 --> 00:05:32,280
the legitimacy this idea in one way or

103
00:05:38,600 --> 00:05:36,120
another my favorite is the Ethiopian

104
00:05:44,350 --> 00:05:38,610
saying on the bottom that when when

105
00:05:51,050 --> 00:05:48,920
Schiller got in on the act a synthesis

106
00:05:53,600 --> 00:05:51,060
which embraces such a multitude of facts

107
00:05:57,260 --> 00:05:53,610
does not rest solely on anyone said of

108
00:06:01,780 --> 00:05:57,270
them and in a sense grows independent of

109
00:06:04,430 --> 00:06:01,790
them all I think that niels bohr

110
00:06:06,970 --> 00:06:04,440
actually tapped into this general idea

111
00:06:09,500 --> 00:06:06,980
with this principle of complementarity

112
00:06:12,440 --> 00:06:09,510
mutually exclusive or contradictory

113
00:06:14,480 --> 00:06:12,450

descriptions can be necessary to give a

114

00:06:18,860 --> 00:06:14,490

more complete representation of a

115

00:06:22,510 --> 00:06:18,870

particular phenomenon and I am sure that

116

00:06:26,540 --> 00:06:22,520

some of you old unreconstructed hippies

117

00:06:29,150 --> 00:06:26,550

will agree with me that maybe the best

118

00:06:32,030 --> 00:06:29,160

all-time description of conceal Ian's

119

00:06:34,840 --> 00:06:32,040

was the motto of the first Whole Earth

120

00:06:37,880 --> 00:06:34,850

Catalog which was published in 1968

121

00:06:43,640 --> 00:06:37,890

saying that you can't put it together it

122

00:06:49,010 --> 00:06:43,650

is together well I want to review some

123

00:06:51,350 --> 00:06:49,020

of the opinions of dr. Wilson this is

124

00:06:55,100 --> 00:06:51,360

what he had to say about Concilium sub

125

00:06:56,750 --> 00:06:55,110

science and the arts neither science nor

126

00:06:59,750 --> 00:06:56,760

the arts can be complete without

127

00:07:02,000 --> 00:06:59,760

combining their separate strings science

128

00:07:04,520 --> 00:07:02,010

needs the intuition and metaphorical

129

00:07:10,640 --> 00:07:04,530

power of the arts and arts needs the

130

00:07:12,629 --> 00:07:10,650

fresh blood of science he says this

131

00:07:16,529 --> 00:07:12,639

about concealed lan's of Sciences

132

00:07:20,969 --> 00:07:16,539

elodie you you say that science cannot

133

00:07:22,709 --> 00:07:20,979

explain spiritual phenomenon why not the

134

00:07:24,719 --> 00:07:22,719

brain scientists are making important

135

00:07:27,450 --> 00:07:24,729

advances in the analysis of complex

136

00:07:29,550 --> 00:07:27,460

operations of the mind there is no

137

00:07:32,760 --> 00:07:29,560

apparent reason why they cannot come out

138

00:07:35,610 --> 00:07:32,770

in time provide a material account of

139

00:07:41,339 --> 00:07:35,620

the emotions and ratiocination that

140

00:07:43,739 --> 00:07:41,349

might accompany spiritual thought this

141

00:07:47,580 --> 00:07:43,749

is what he says about the concilium

142

00:07:50,760 --> 00:07:47,590

science and ethics the evidence I

143

00:07:53,790 --> 00:07:50,770

believe favours a purely material origin

144

00:07:57,749 --> 00:07:53,800

of ethics and it meets the criterion of

145

00:08:00,320 --> 00:07:57,759

Concilium causal explanations of brain

146

00:08:03,450 --> 00:08:00,330

activity and evolution while imperfect

147

00:08:05,100 --> 00:08:03,460

already cover the most facts known about

148

00:08:06,600 --> 00:08:05,110

moral behavior with the greatest

149

00:08:08,670 --> 00:08:06,610

accuracy and the smallest number of

150

00:08:13,260 --> 00:08:08,680

freestanding assumptions and yes I've

151

00:08:17,399 --> 00:08:13,270

lest I forget I may be wrong this is

152

00:08:23,309 --> 00:08:17,409

what he says about science and and

153

00:08:25,860 --> 00:08:23,319

ethics in and a further comment I think

154

00:08:26,939 --> 00:08:25,870

it is an error to pivot discussion of

155

00:08:28,230 --> 00:08:26,949

ethics upon the free standing

156

00:08:31,350 --> 00:08:28,240

assumptions that contemporary

157

00:08:33,300 --> 00:08:31,360

philosophers who have evidently never

158

00:08:34,589 --> 00:08:33,310

given thought to the evolutionary origin

159

00:08:37,980 --> 00:08:34,599

and material functioning of the human

160

00:08:40,740 --> 00:08:37,990

brain and no other domain of the

161

00:08:44,970 --> 00:08:40,750

humanities is a union with the Natural

162

00:08:47,960 --> 00:08:44,980

Sciences more urgently needed well I was

163

00:08:51,930 --> 00:08:47,970

getting a little nervous about this time

164

00:08:55,730 --> 00:08:51,940

but I thought I just may not have

165

00:09:00,240 --> 00:08:55,740

understood his drift but it became clear

166

00:09:03,569 --> 00:09:00,250

with further reading and this sort of

167

00:09:06,829 --> 00:09:03,579

cemented my suspicion on that for him

168

00:09:09,300 --> 00:09:06,839

the material realm is absolutely primary

169

00:09:11,009 --> 00:09:09,310

the general structure of the human nerve

170

00:09:13,769 --> 00:09:11,019

cell has now been charted in

171

00:09:15,870 --> 00:09:13,779

considerable detail its electrical

172

00:09:18,329 --> 00:09:15,880

discharge and synaptic chemistry are

173

00:09:22,730 --> 00:09:18,339

partly understood and can be expressed

174

00:09:26,000 --> 00:09:22,740

in formulas obedient to the principles

175

00:09:31,190 --> 00:09:26,010

physics and chemistry

176

00:09:34,700 --> 00:09:31,200

and for professor Wilson the brain makes

177

00:09:37,280 --> 00:09:34,710

consciousness the stage has been set to

178

00:09:39,710 --> 00:09:37,290

attack the master unsolved problem of

179

00:09:41,510 --> 00:09:39,720

biology how the hundred billion nerve

180

00:09:45,770 --> 00:09:41,520

cells of the brain work together to

181

00:09:47,770 --> 00:09:45,780

create consciousness the task is made

182

00:09:50,540 --> 00:09:47,780

somewhat easier by the fact that

183

00:09:53,030 --> 00:09:50,550

disciplines within biology itself are

184

00:10:01,520 --> 00:09:53,040

now generally consistent in growing more

185

00:10:03,410 --> 00:10:01,530

so with each year and so at this time

186

00:10:06,950 --> 00:10:03,420

I'm beginning to get a little nervous

187

00:10:10,100 --> 00:10:06,960

about this considerin side iya because

188

00:10:12,670 --> 00:10:10,110

he asserts that the materialist primary

189

00:10:15,560 --> 00:10:12,680

I can't see how there is any truth

190

00:10:17,390 --> 00:10:15,570

authentic conceal lan's any genuine

191

00:10:20,380 --> 00:10:17,400

jumping together because there are no

192

00:10:23,840 --> 00:10:20,390

equal status accorded to the jumpers and

193

00:10:29,350 --> 00:10:23,850

so the jumping becomes essentially a

194

00:10:32,180 --> 00:10:29,360

cosmetic operation now if there's an

195

00:10:33,890 --> 00:10:32,190

excavating opinion that has ever been

196

00:10:35,870 --> 00:10:33,900

rendered toward this point of view I

197

00:10:37,580 --> 00:10:35,880

think it might be Sir John Eccles who

198

00:10:44,030 --> 00:10:37,590

won the Nobel Prize in Physiology and

199

00:10:47,830 --> 00:10:44,040

medicine in 1963 he and his partner Karl

200

00:10:49,700 --> 00:10:47,840

Popper promissory materialism is a

201
00:10:52,820 --> 00:10:49,710
superstition without a rational

202
00:10:54,740 --> 00:10:52,830
foundation it is simply a religious

203
00:10:56,270 --> 00:10:54,750
belief held by dogmatic materialists who

204
00:11:00,250 --> 00:10:56,280
confuse their religion with their

205
00:11:06,010 --> 00:11:00,260
science it has all the features of a

206
00:11:10,400 --> 00:11:06,020
messianic prophecy now if you go to the

207
00:11:13,060 --> 00:11:10,410
index in Wilson's book here's what's

208
00:11:15,950 --> 00:11:13,070
missing there's no mention

209
00:11:17,090 --> 00:11:15,960
parapsychology or SCI there's no mention

210
00:11:19,640 --> 00:11:17,100
of nonlocality

211
00:11:22,310 --> 00:11:19,650
no mention of entanglement and certainly

212
00:11:25,250 --> 00:11:22,320
no mention of healing it is true that in

213
00:11:28,460 --> 00:11:25,260

the text ESP and psycho Kinesis are

214

00:11:33,530 --> 00:11:28,470

mentioned but they are compared to

215

00:11:36,800 --> 00:11:33,540

sorcery and sympathetic magic so one

216

00:11:39,790 --> 00:11:36,810

wonders how Wilson can speak of a unity

217

00:11:42,790 --> 00:11:39,800

of separate categories

218

00:11:48,820 --> 00:11:42,800

raishin and thought when so much is left

219

00:11:52,050 --> 00:11:48,830

out well he was not done a this book the

220

00:11:55,870 --> 00:11:52,060

the next book after her conciliate

221

00:11:58,509 --> 00:11:55,880

2000-2006 book the creation in which he

222

00:12:01,410 --> 00:11:58,519

suggested that scientists ought to quote

223

00:12:03,940 --> 00:12:01,420

offer the hand of friendship to

224

00:12:06,880 --> 00:12:03,950

religious leaders and build an alliance

225

00:12:08,829 --> 00:12:06,890

with them and he said science and

226

00:12:11,259 --> 00:12:08,839

religion are two of the most potent

227

00:12:15,970 --> 00:12:11,269

forces on earth and they should come

228

00:12:20,230 --> 00:12:15,980

together to save the creation but before

229

00:12:23,230 --> 00:12:20,240

that and the 1998 book conciliate he was

230

00:12:25,090 --> 00:12:23,240

deeply ambivalent toward religion but

231

00:12:27,540 --> 00:12:25,100

religious belief has another destructive

232

00:12:31,150 --> 00:12:27,550

side equaling the worst excess of

233

00:12:33,400 --> 00:12:31,160

materialism an estimated 100,000 belief

234

00:12:36,639 --> 00:12:33,410

systems have existed in history and many

235

00:12:38,350 --> 00:12:36,649

have fostered ethnic tribal wars each of

236

00:12:40,840 --> 00:12:38,360

the three great Western religions in

237

00:12:43,900 --> 00:12:40,850

particular expanded at one time or

238

00:12:48,490 --> 00:12:43,910

another in symbiosis with military

239

00:12:53,949 --> 00:12:48,500

aggression so that true character arises

240

00:12:56,560 --> 00:12:53,959

from a deeper well than religion and as

241

00:13:02,170 --> 00:12:56,570

recently as four years ago he had begun

242

00:13:05,710 --> 00:13:02,180

to walk back his plea for unification or

243

00:13:07,750 --> 00:13:05,720

a conciliate science and religion he

244

00:13:11,050 --> 00:13:07,760

gave an interview to New Scientist

245

00:13:14,319 --> 00:13:11,060

journal which in which he said religion

246

00:13:17,710 --> 00:13:14,329

is dragging us down and this is a direct

247

00:13:20,290 --> 00:13:17,720

quote so I would say that for the sake

248

00:13:23,230 --> 00:13:20,300

of human progress the best thing we

249

00:13:27,400 --> 00:13:23,240

could possibly do would be to diminish

250

00:13:33,660 --> 00:13:27,410

to the point of eliminating religious

251

00:13:37,480 --> 00:13:33,670

faith so a central question for me and

252

00:13:41,199 --> 00:13:37,490

this Concilium debate is who are going

253

00:13:44,530 --> 00:13:41,209

to be the gatekeepers who gets to decide

254

00:13:48,579 --> 00:13:44,540

what jumps together and what it is that

255

00:13:52,809 --> 00:13:48,589

is doing the jumping and and what is the

256

00:13:57,610 --> 00:13:54,670

there is a huge difference opinion on

257

00:13:59,019 --> 00:13:57,620

this these questions one person I think

258

00:14:01,239 --> 00:13:59,029

he was particularly wise in this

259

00:14:03,759 --> 00:14:01,249

discussion had a discussion here at this

260

00:14:06,519 --> 00:14:03,769

conference a couple of years ago the

261

00:14:10,329 --> 00:14:06,529

philosopher Jeffrey [h__h] who is at

262

00:14:12,069 --> 00:14:10,339

Rice University in Houston there are

263

00:14:16,150 --> 00:14:12,079

those who claim that consciousness is

264

00:14:20,259 --> 00:14:16,160

not its own thing that it is reducible

265

00:14:21,999 --> 00:14:20,269

to warm wet tissue and brain hood but to

266

00:14:24,730 --> 00:14:22,009

this day no one has even come close to

267

00:14:29,379 --> 00:14:24,740

showing how this might work probably

268

00:14:32,470 --> 00:14:29,389

because it doesn't moreover as far as we

269

00:14:35,110 --> 00:14:32,480

can tell at the moment consciousness is

270

00:14:37,360 --> 00:14:35,120

entirely sewage in areas we know of

271

00:14:41,230 --> 00:14:37,370

nothing else like it in the universe and

272

00:14:44,949 --> 00:14:41,240

all we know we know only in through and

273

00:14:48,189 --> 00:14:44,959

because of this same consciousness or as

274

00:14:51,160 --> 00:14:48,199

the research engineer Irma's Emerson

275

00:14:53,619 --> 00:14:51,170

Pugh cleverly put it if the brain were

276

00:15:01,119 --> 00:14:53,629

so simple that we could understand it we

277

00:15:05,049 --> 00:15:01,129

would be so simple we couldn't there are

278

00:15:07,660 --> 00:15:05,059

any number of eminent people working in

279

00:15:11,530 --> 00:15:07,670

esoteric science these days who flatly

280

00:15:12,960 --> 00:15:11,540

disagree with the certainties of dr.

281

00:15:18,009 --> 00:15:12,970

Wilson that the brain creates

282

00:15:19,629 --> 00:15:18,019

consciousness one of my favorite such

283

00:15:22,269 --> 00:15:19,639

individual is a Stewart Kaufman of

284

00:15:24,730 --> 00:15:22,279

theoretical biologist he complex systems

285

00:15:27,249 --> 00:15:24,740

theorists nobody has the faintest idea

286

00:15:30,790 --> 00:15:27,259

what a consciousness he is I don't have

287

00:15:33,730 --> 00:15:30,800

any idea nor does anyone else including

288

00:15:36,490 --> 00:15:33,740

the philosophers of mind now he wasn't

289

00:15:39,730 --> 00:15:36,500

just being a smartass he has a lot of

290

00:15:41,740 --> 00:15:39,740

colleagues who agree with him and among

291

00:15:44,379 --> 00:15:41,750

whom is one of the leading physicists of

292

00:15:46,299 --> 00:15:44,389

our time Freeman Dyson the origin of

293

00:15:48,850 --> 00:15:46,309

life is a total mystery and so is the

294

00:15:50,919 --> 00:15:48,860

existence of human consciousness we have

295

00:15:53,319 --> 00:15:50,929

no clear idea how the electrical

296

00:15:55,030 --> 00:15:53,329

discharges occurring in nerve cells in

297

00:15:58,929 --> 00:15:55,040

our brains are connected with their

298

00:16:01,569 --> 00:15:58,939

feelings and desires and actions now

299

00:16:05,190 --> 00:16:01,579

there has always existed alongside this

300

00:16:07,740 --> 00:16:05,200

line of thought and uncompromising

301

00:16:10,770 --> 00:16:07,750

train of thought represented perhaps

302

00:16:13,290 --> 00:16:10,780

most decisively by Daniel Dennett who's

303

00:16:15,420 --> 00:16:13,300

the philosopher at Tufts when we

304

00:16:17,130 --> 00:16:15,430

consider whether free will is an

305

00:16:20,550 --> 00:16:17,140

illusion of reality we're looking into

306

00:16:22,970 --> 00:16:20,560

an abyss what seems to confront us is a

307

00:16:25,890 --> 00:16:22,980

plunge into kneel ISM and despair

308

00:16:27,660 --> 00:16:25,900

there's no stopping point in this line

309

00:16:29,910 --> 00:16:27,670

of reasoning for it down it and his

310

00:16:33,330 --> 00:16:29,920

contreras it leads to what has been

311

00:16:36,150 --> 00:16:33,340

called eliminative materialism in which

312

00:16:40,260 --> 00:16:36,160

then it proclaims we're all zombies

313

00:16:43,800 --> 00:16:40,270

nobody is conscious this is from his

314

00:16:50,040 --> 00:16:43,810

book ironically entitled consciousness

315

00:16:53,910 --> 00:16:50,050

explained it seems to escape

316

00:16:58,110 --> 00:16:53,920

dr. Dennis awareness that if in fact he

317

00:17:01,350 --> 00:16:58,120

is right then he is a zombie also who

318

00:17:03,450 --> 00:17:01,360

were all zombies and if he is right and

319

00:17:07,829 --> 00:17:03,460

that nobody is conscious then neither is

320

00:17:10,050 --> 00:17:07,839

he so why on earth would we feel

321

00:17:12,809 --> 00:17:10,060

compelled to be compelled by his

322

00:17:14,790 --> 00:17:12,819

reasoning he has no choice but to say

323

00:17:16,679 --> 00:17:14,800

otherwise there are people who have

324

00:17:20,490 --> 00:17:16,689

pointed out these absurdities among them

325

00:17:22,800 --> 00:17:20,500

is Bernard or Castro the computer

326

00:17:24,390 --> 00:17:22,810

scientist who is extremely prolific in

327

00:17:27,270 --> 00:17:24,400

writing books about consciousness these

328

00:17:28,920 --> 00:17:27,280

days and I recommend all of them here we

329

00:17:31,710 --> 00:17:28,930

have consciousness trying to trick

330

00:17:33,330 --> 00:17:31,720

itself having trying to trick

331

00:17:36,200 --> 00:17:33,340

consciousness into believing that it

332

00:17:39,030 --> 00:17:36,210

doesn't exist the motivation behind

333

00:17:40,830 --> 00:17:39,040

eliminative materialism is clear because

334

00:17:43,290 --> 00:17:40,840

if we deny the very existence of

335

00:17:47,580 --> 00:17:43,300

consciousness presto we no longer need

336

00:17:50,580 --> 00:17:47,590

to explain it and one of the strongest

337

00:17:52,830 --> 00:17:50,590

critics of eliminative materialism comes

338

00:17:54,690 --> 00:17:52,840

from my old alma mater the University of

339

00:17:57,860 --> 00:17:54,700

Texas at Austin

340

00:18:02,220 --> 00:17:57,870

it's from Galen Strawson the philosopher

341

00:18:03,870 --> 00:18:02,230

this particular denial is the strangest

342

00:18:09,870 --> 00:18:03,880

thing that has ever happened in the

343

00:18:12,090 --> 00:18:09,880

whole history of human thought so I want

344

00:18:14,850 --> 00:18:12,100

just to dwell on this mysteriousness of

345

00:18:17,430 --> 00:18:14,860

consciousness for just a little bit here

346

00:18:18,330 --> 00:18:17,440

I think one of the best books that ever

347

00:18:21,600 --> 00:18:18,340

examined the

348

00:18:24,720 --> 00:18:21,610

issues was written back in 1980s the

349

00:18:27,169 --> 00:18:24,730

late 80s by Nick Herbert the quantum

350

00:18:29,580 --> 00:18:27,179

physicist and expert at nonlocality

351
00:18:31,529 --> 00:18:29,590
scientists science his biggest mysteries

352
00:18:33,029 --> 00:18:31,539
the nature of consciousness it is not

353
00:18:34,890 --> 00:18:33,039
that we possess bad or imperfect

354
00:18:37,680 --> 00:18:34,900
theories of human awareness we simply

355
00:18:39,810 --> 00:18:37,690
have no such theories at all about all

356
00:18:42,450 --> 00:18:39,820
we know about consciousness that it has

357
00:18:45,269 --> 00:18:42,460
something to do with the head rather

358
00:18:49,980 --> 00:18:45,279
than the foot and I'm not so sure about

359
00:18:54,149 --> 00:18:49,990
the last sentence I actually Donald

360
00:18:56,880 --> 00:18:54,159
Hoffman who is my favorite cognitive

361
00:18:59,370 --> 00:18:56,890
scientist these days he's at UC Irvine

362
00:19:01,830 --> 00:18:59,380
he gave a talk here at dinner one was

363
00:19:04,830 --> 00:19:01,840

that three or four years ago the

364

00:19:07,320 --> 00:19:04,840

scientific study of consciousness is in

365

00:19:10,680 --> 00:19:07,330

the embarrassing position of having no

366

00:19:12,659 --> 00:19:10,690

scientific theory of consciousness so

367

00:19:14,760 --> 00:19:12,669

the question comes up how sure those of

368

00:19:21,389 --> 00:19:14,770

us who are interested in these concepts

369

00:19:24,930 --> 00:19:21,399

respond to people who disagree JB

370

00:19:26,730 --> 00:19:24,940

Priestley the English playwright and

371

00:19:28,409 --> 00:19:26,740

philosopher wrote a book called man in

372

00:19:30,480 --> 00:19:28,419

time several years ago it's one of the

373

00:19:35,909 --> 00:19:30,490

best looks at parapsychology ever I've

374

00:19:39,510 --> 00:19:35,919

ever seen he suggested this of course if

375

00:19:42,899 --> 00:19:39,520

a man with this theory at state makes up

376

00:19:45,090 --> 00:19:42,909

his mind not to be shown that queer

377

00:19:47,250 --> 00:19:45,100

things are happening little can be done

378

00:19:53,490 --> 00:19:47,260

except to make a face at him and a rude

379

00:19:56,840 --> 00:19:53,500

noise I've tried that before it I I hope

380

00:19:59,490 --> 00:19:56,850

it works better for you that did for me

381

00:20:03,680 --> 00:19:59,500

and I want to circle back on this

382

00:20:08,940 --> 00:20:03,690

insistence by professor Wilson that we

383

00:20:11,130 --> 00:20:08,950

eliminate religious faiths one would

384

00:20:12,960 --> 00:20:11,140

like to know I think what is there

385

00:20:18,360 --> 00:20:12,970

anything else that would be eliminated

386

00:20:19,440 --> 00:20:18,370

in the process well there's some people

387

00:20:22,230 --> 00:20:19,450

who thought that that would be

388

00:20:24,149 --> 00:20:22,240

disastrous among them was Einstein who

389

00:20:27,930 --> 00:20:24,159

said that science without religion is

390

00:20:31,600 --> 00:20:27,940

lame and religion without science is

391

00:20:34,180 --> 00:20:31,610

blind Sir Arthur Eddington chimed in

392

00:20:36,609 --> 00:20:34,190

dismiss the idea that natural law may

393

00:20:38,259 --> 00:20:36,619

swallow up religion it cannot even

394

00:20:43,060 --> 00:20:38,269

tackle the multiplication table

395

00:20:45,909 --> 00:20:43,070

single-handed niels bohr was not far

396

00:20:48,940 --> 00:20:45,919

behind the fact that religions through

397

00:20:50,619 --> 00:20:48,950

the ages have spoken and images parables

398

00:20:52,090 --> 00:20:50,629

and paradoxes means simply that there

399

00:20:55,269 --> 00:20:52,100

are no other ways of grasping the

400

00:20:56,649 --> 00:20:55,279

reality which to which they refer but

401
00:21:00,129 --> 00:20:56,659
that does not mean that it is not a

402
00:21:02,440 --> 00:21:00,139
genuine reality and splitting this

403
00:21:06,759 --> 00:21:02,450
reality into an objective and subjective

404
00:21:08,499 --> 00:21:06,769
side won't get us very far and they'll

405
00:21:10,450 --> 00:21:08,509
paste a fifteen or twenty years they've

406
00:21:13,180 --> 00:21:10,460
been some outstanding surveys that have

407
00:21:16,299 --> 00:21:13,190
wondered how scientists line up on these

408
00:21:20,830 --> 00:21:16,309
issues one which was very influential

409
00:21:23,049 --> 00:21:20,840
was published in nature in 97 and Larsen

410
00:21:25,200 --> 00:21:23,059
and with them found that 39 percent of

411
00:21:27,220 --> 00:21:25,210
biologists physicists and mathematicians

412
00:21:29,049 --> 00:21:27,230
these were people who are currently

413
00:21:32,470 --> 00:21:29,059

working in science in the u.s. at the

414

00:21:35,919 --> 00:21:32,480

time they believe not only in a God but

415

00:21:38,680 --> 00:21:35,929

in a God who answers prayers and the

416

00:21:41,229 --> 00:21:38,690

scientific and medical network last year

417

00:21:43,960 --> 00:21:41,239

and I regard this organisations as kind

418

00:21:49,479 --> 00:21:43,970

of a sister organization of ours the SSC

419

00:21:51,249 --> 00:21:49,489

a 2008 survey survey of 3,000 medical

420

00:21:55,119 --> 00:21:51,259

technical and engineering professionals

421

00:21:58,029 --> 00:21:55,129

in the UK Germany and France they found

422

00:22:03,519 --> 00:21:58,039

that 25 percent described themselves as

423

00:22:07,720 --> 00:22:03,529

atheists and 45 percent as religious or

424

00:22:11,080 --> 00:22:07,730

spiritual and one of our own has weighed

425

00:22:13,989 --> 00:22:11,090

in heavily on this idea Stephen Schwartz

426

00:22:15,909 --> 00:22:13,999

as a researcher I think enduring

427

00:22:18,340 --> 00:22:15,919

religion should be seen as examples of

428

00:22:20,710 --> 00:22:18,350

empirical science I used the term

429

00:22:23,229 --> 00:22:20,720

enduring religions to distinguish from

430

00:22:24,999 --> 00:22:23,239

transitory cults all of the endearing

431

00:22:27,940 --> 00:22:25,009

faiths over generations of millennia

432

00:22:31,930 --> 00:22:27,950

developed a kind of empirical Nero Nero

433

00:22:35,320 --> 00:22:31,940

biology involving opening to non-local

434

00:22:38,229 --> 00:22:35,330

consciousness Steven continues there is

435

00:22:42,070 --> 00:22:38,239

an innate recognition of the reality of

436

00:22:44,870 --> 00:22:42,080

non-local consciousness in all religions

437

00:22:47,390 --> 00:22:44,880

a small group of materialist scientists

438

00:22:49,400 --> 00:22:47,400

another small cohort of atheists and a

439

00:22:52,960 --> 00:22:49,410

few small factions may think otherwise

440

00:22:55,700 --> 00:22:52,970

but for the bulk of humanity across time

441

00:22:58,580 --> 00:22:55,710

geography and culture within the

442

00:23:00,760 --> 00:22:58,590

religious spiritual context the reality

443

00:23:04,300 --> 00:23:00,770

of non-local consciousness has been

444

00:23:09,020 --> 00:23:04,310

foundational across all religious

445

00:23:11,240 --> 00:23:09,030

rituals are designed to the same in to

446

00:23:15,560 --> 00:23:11,250

train a person to attain a sustained

447

00:23:18,740 --> 00:23:15,570

intention focused awareness this is this

448

00:23:22,640 --> 00:23:18,750

mechanism has to do with grounding in

449

00:23:25,940 --> 00:23:22,650

the rituals so I want to make a few

450

00:23:30,370 --> 00:23:25,950

proposals about what not guide us in the

451
00:23:36,560 --> 00:23:30,380
future and respond to these contentious

452
00:23:38,570 --> 00:23:36,570
positions I think that at the bottom we

453
00:23:40,250 --> 00:23:38,580
will recognize that consciousness is

454
00:23:43,460 --> 00:23:40,260
simply fundamental and non-local in

455
00:23:44,240 --> 00:23:43,470
space and time and as such having no

456
00:23:48,560 --> 00:23:44,250
boundaries

457
00:23:51,320 --> 00:23:48,570
is infinite and unitary standing on the

458
00:23:54,740 --> 00:23:51,330
shoulders of an oft-repeated comment by

459
00:23:57,260 --> 00:23:54,750
max planck our regard consciousness is

460
00:23:59,690 --> 00:23:57,270
fundamental our regard matter as

461
00:24:02,870 --> 00:23:59,700
derivative in consciousness we cannot

462
00:24:05,060 --> 00:24:02,880
get behind consciousness everything that

463
00:24:09,890 --> 00:24:05,070

we talk about everything that we regard

464

00:24:13,670 --> 00:24:09,900

as existing postulates consciousness and

465

00:24:15,770 --> 00:24:13,680

Jeff Krol has chimed in consciousness is

466

00:24:19,580 --> 00:24:15,780

the fundamental ground of all that we

467

00:24:22,910 --> 00:24:19,590

know or ever will know it is the ground

468

00:24:25,040 --> 00:24:22,920

of all the sciences all of the arts all

469

00:24:28,340 --> 00:24:25,050

of the social sciences all of the

470

00:24:32,240 --> 00:24:28,350

humanities indeed all human knowledge

471

00:24:36,350 --> 00:24:32,250

and experience and I want to circle back

472

00:24:37,760 --> 00:24:36,360

to my own profession which I think has

473

00:24:39,820 --> 00:24:37,770

something important to say about this

474

00:24:42,140 --> 00:24:39,830

debate I believe that in the future

475

00:24:45,080 --> 00:24:42,150

consciousness will be increasingly seen

476

00:24:47,500 --> 00:24:45,090

as a key in healing and I'm willing to

477

00:24:50,210 --> 00:24:47,510

say that based on current data

478

00:24:53,630 --> 00:24:50,220

separating science from religion and

479

00:24:55,760 --> 00:24:53,640

faith makes absolutely no sense

480

00:24:56,650 --> 00:24:55,770

whatsoever in the field of clinical

481

00:25:00,280 --> 00:24:56,660

medicine

482

00:25:02,200 --> 00:25:00,290

and I say that based on an avalanche of

483

00:25:06,340 --> 00:25:02,210

data that has been accumulating for the

484

00:25:09,520 --> 00:25:06,350

past 40 to 50 years in my profession we

485

00:25:11,920 --> 00:25:09,530

now know that those people who follow a

486

00:25:14,290 --> 00:25:11,930

spiritual or religious path and I have

487

00:25:15,970 --> 00:25:14,300

to add that it does not seem greatly to

488

00:25:19,240 --> 00:25:15,980

matter which one they choose but if they

489

00:25:21,460 --> 00:25:19,250

choose one and stick with it they live

490

00:25:25,870 --> 00:25:21,470

on average seven to thirteen years

491

00:25:28,450 --> 00:25:25,880

longer than people who do not and in the

492

00:25:30,250 --> 00:25:28,460

process they have a lower instance of

493

00:25:33,270 --> 00:25:30,260

all the major decisions you want to look

494

00:25:36,790 --> 00:25:33,280

at including heart disease in cancer we

495

00:25:39,550 --> 00:25:36,800

had a little hint back in the 90s that

496

00:25:42,640 --> 00:25:39,560

this evolution thinking was in process

497

00:25:44,710 --> 00:25:42,650

by a cover of the Journal of American

498

00:25:46,900 --> 00:25:44,720

Medical Association was still one of the

499

00:25:50,440 --> 00:25:46,910

most prestigious medical journals in the

500

00:25:53,500 --> 00:25:50,450

world and here we see a gloved and gound

501
00:25:55,420 --> 00:25:53,510
and scrubbed surgeon with his head bowed

502
00:25:58,000 --> 00:25:55,430
and his hands folded in some sort of

503
00:26:02,460 --> 00:25:58,010
prayer before he enters the surgery

504
00:26:05,470 --> 00:26:02,470
suite my wife and I have Barbra have a

505
00:26:08,140 --> 00:26:05,480
have opportunities to talk to groups of

506
00:26:10,720 --> 00:26:08,150
doctors about these ideas from time to

507
00:26:13,780 --> 00:26:10,730
time we were giving a talk in Tacoma

508
00:26:16,750 --> 00:26:13,790
Washington a while back and after our

509
00:26:19,360 --> 00:26:16,760
talk a female surgeon came forward and

510
00:26:21,550 --> 00:26:19,370
she said I have to share with you two

511
00:26:23,170 --> 00:26:21,560
the prayer that I always used before I

512
00:26:26,080 --> 00:26:23,180
enter the surgery suite

513
00:26:29,590 --> 00:26:26,090

she said when I'm gloved and gound and

514

00:26:32,260 --> 00:26:29,600

scrubbed I hold up my hands and I pray

515

00:26:39,830 --> 00:26:32,270

dear God these are your hands now don't

516

00:26:45,420 --> 00:26:41,970

don't say surgeons and don't have a

517

00:26:48,650 --> 00:26:45,430

sense of humor I'm pretty enthusiastic

518

00:26:52,200 --> 00:26:48,660

about this book it's recently out it's

519

00:26:56,100 --> 00:26:52,210

the title really contains a powerful

520

00:26:58,170 --> 00:26:56,110

message physicians untold stories and it

521

00:27:00,000 --> 00:26:58,180

was written by Scott Cole Baba who as an

522

00:27:03,120 --> 00:27:00,010

internal medicine doc and the Wheaton

523

00:27:05,700 --> 00:27:03,130

Illinois area this this book has got

524

00:27:08,160 --> 00:27:05,710

some real whoppers in it he did

525

00:27:11,490 --> 00:27:08,170

something I've never seen done before he

526

00:27:13,260 --> 00:27:11,500

went around to his colleagues on the

527

00:27:15,120 --> 00:27:13,270

medical staff and he said I want you to

528

00:27:21,060 --> 00:27:15,130

ride up for me the weirdest thing you

529

00:27:24,600 --> 00:27:21,070

have ever seen and they did and one of

530

00:27:26,310 --> 00:27:24,610

these stories was contributed by dr.

531

00:27:29,370 --> 00:27:26,320

Thomas Marshall who is an internal

532

00:27:31,760 --> 00:27:29,380

medicine doctor in this hospital and

533

00:27:35,460 --> 00:27:31,770

this had to do with a young woman

534

00:27:37,020 --> 00:27:35,470

Barbara Comiskey and Barbara stories all

535

00:27:39,840 --> 00:27:37,030

over the internet if you won't search it

536

00:27:42,630 --> 00:27:39,850

for yourself you can but I would

537

00:27:44,730 --> 00:27:42,640

recommend the book here's the story and

538

00:27:51,510 --> 00:27:44,740

this is an elaborate history so I'm

539

00:27:54,060 --> 00:27:51,520

going to rely on a few slides here she

540

00:27:56,280 --> 00:27:54,070

was a gymnast and a talented flute

541

00:28:00,450 --> 00:27:56,290

player and in high school in the Wheaton

542

00:28:01,980 --> 00:28:00,460

Illinois town at age 15 she developed

543

00:28:03,840 --> 00:28:01,990

multiple sclerosis and there was no

544

00:28:05,760 --> 00:28:03,850

doubt about the diagnosis because she

545

00:28:09,240 --> 00:28:05,770

was taken to Mayo Clinic and this was

546

00:28:13,800 --> 00:28:09,250

certified she graduated high school in

547

00:28:15,420 --> 00:28:13,810

68 and entered college but she dropped

548

00:28:19,220 --> 00:28:15,430

out because she just couldn't manage it

549

00:28:22,170 --> 00:28:19,230

physically things went from bad to worse

550

00:28:25,370 --> 00:28:22,180

quickly she had to respiratory arrest in

551

00:28:27,750 --> 00:28:25,380

the early 1970s she required

552

00:28:30,150 --> 00:28:27,760

hospitalizations several of them for

553

00:28:32,970 --> 00:28:30,160

pneumonia she had a collapsed lung in

554

00:28:36,330 --> 00:28:32,980

1980 she wound up having a tracheostomy

555

00:28:38,580 --> 00:28:36,340

with supplemental oxygen because she

556

00:28:40,260 --> 00:28:38,590

couldn't breathe well she lost control

557

00:28:42,760 --> 00:28:40,270

of her bowel and bladder and had an

558

00:28:47,060 --> 00:28:42,770

indwelling urinary catheter and

559

00:28:48,560 --> 00:28:47,070

externally ileostomy to the outside she

560

00:28:51,920 --> 00:28:48,570

became legally blind

561

00:28:55,220 --> 00:28:51,930

she lost her vision she was previously

562

00:28:59,720 --> 00:28:55,230

religious but she lost her faith along

563

00:29:01,910 --> 00:28:59,730

with the other problems she became bed

564

00:29:04,700 --> 00:29:01,920

bound she couldn't stand up she had

565

00:29:07,670 --> 00:29:04,710

severe contracture she was in a

566

00:29:10,850 --> 00:29:07,680

permanent physical condition and her bed

567

00:29:14,540 --> 00:29:10,860

pretzeled up with that without much

568

00:29:16,130 --> 00:29:14,550

ability to move at all she developed in

569

00:29:17,990 --> 00:29:16,140

an inability to swallow she had a

570

00:29:22,400 --> 00:29:18,000

feeding tube inserted into her stomach

571

00:29:24,320 --> 00:29:22,410

from the outside so that by 1981 there

572

00:29:26,150 --> 00:29:24,330

was not much hope that she would last

573

00:29:29,450 --> 00:29:26,160

very much longer so she was entered into

574

00:29:32,570 --> 00:29:29,460

hospice care and was given six months at

575

00:29:34,760 --> 00:29:32,580

the most to live and her internist and

576

00:29:38,030 --> 00:29:34,770

her family got together and agree that

577

00:29:40,280 --> 00:29:38,040

when she she died that there would be no

578

00:29:43,060 --> 00:29:40,290

heroics and absolutely no

579

00:29:48,830 --> 00:29:43,070

cardiopulmonary resuscitation

580

00:29:53,590 --> 00:29:48,840

well something big happened on June 7th

581

00:29:56,840 --> 00:29:53,600

1981 they aired her story on a local

582

00:29:59,690 --> 00:29:56,850

limited radio station broadcasting only

583

00:30:01,430 --> 00:29:59,700

in the Wheaton region asking for prayers

584

00:30:02,600 --> 00:30:01,440

not only for her but for all of the

585

00:30:05,810 --> 00:30:02,610

other people in the listening audience

586

00:30:07,880 --> 00:30:05,820

who were seriously ill and we know that

587

00:30:10,550 --> 00:30:07,890

there was an overwhelming response to

588

00:30:13,040 --> 00:30:10,560

the prayer requests because later the

589

00:30:16,640 --> 00:30:13,050

station received bags and bags of

590

00:30:19,340 --> 00:30:16,650

letters and so this Sunday afternoon she

591

00:30:23,570 --> 00:30:19,350

had two girlfriends who were visiting

592

00:30:27,560 --> 00:30:23,580

her and all of these subsequent events

593

00:30:31,940 --> 00:30:27,570

were testified to and witnessed Barbara

594

00:30:35,420 --> 00:30:31,950

says that she heard a voice it was a

595

00:30:39,140 --> 00:30:35,430

male's voice and it said my child get up

596

00:30:46,490 --> 00:30:39,150

in a walk her interpretation was that

597

00:30:48,440 --> 00:30:46,500

God was speaking to her so she did she

598

00:30:50,510 --> 00:30:48,450

jumped out of bed she removed her oxygen

599

00:30:53,510 --> 00:30:50,520

and for the first time in several years

600

00:30:56,990 --> 00:30:53,520

she stood on her own two legs her vision

601
00:30:59,330 --> 00:30:57,000
came back and she was no longer short of

602
00:31:03,170 --> 00:30:59,340
breath off of oxygen and her mother

603
00:31:05,540 --> 00:31:03,180
heard all this commotion in the bedroom

604
00:31:09,410 --> 00:31:05,550
she came in and apparently Barbara's

605
00:31:13,610 --> 00:31:09,420
body had began to change her mother said

606
00:31:15,440 --> 00:31:13,620
you have muscles again well her father

607
00:31:20,200 --> 00:31:15,450
came in the room and he gave her a big

608
00:31:23,840 --> 00:31:20,210
bear hug and wall stir around the room

609
00:31:25,190 --> 00:31:23,850
and this being a Sunday and since all

610
00:31:29,120 --> 00:31:25,200
these nice things were happening they

611
00:31:32,180 --> 00:31:29,130
decided they better go back to church so

612
00:31:34,310 --> 00:31:32,190
they did and see everybody in the

613
00:31:37,310 --> 00:31:34,320

congregation knew this woman was dying

614

00:31:38,840 --> 00:31:37,320

and here she is walking from the back of

615

00:31:45,020 --> 00:31:38,850

the church up the central aisle to the

616

00:31:51,260 --> 00:31:45,030

front and the minister did not handle

617

00:31:53,900 --> 00:31:51,270

this well he he as it was described he

618

00:31:56,750 --> 00:31:53,910

fell against the pulpit for support and

619

00:32:01,670 --> 00:31:56,760

he kept muttering this is nice this is

620

00:32:04,000 --> 00:32:01,680

very nice so so everybody went home and

621

00:32:07,160 --> 00:32:04,010

the next day the family took her to the

622

00:32:11,030 --> 00:32:07,170

office of dr. Thomas Marshall her

623

00:32:13,220 --> 00:32:11,040

long-term internist who had seen her

624

00:32:15,440 --> 00:32:13,230

through all of this business here's what

625

00:32:17,750 --> 00:32:15,450

he said although I was seeing an

626
00:32:20,000 --> 00:32:17,760
apparition he was my patient who was not

627
00:32:22,610 --> 00:32:20,010
expected to live another week totally

628
00:32:24,080 --> 00:32:22,620
cured I stopped all of her medication

629
00:32:25,760 --> 00:32:24,090
and took out her bladder catheter but

630
00:32:28,760 --> 00:32:25,770
she wasn't quite ready to have a trach

631
00:32:33,130 --> 00:32:28,770
tube removed until another visit no one

632
00:32:36,890 --> 00:32:33,140
had ever seen anything like this before

633
00:32:38,750 --> 00:32:36,900
so that afternoon he sent her for a

634
00:32:42,440 --> 00:32:38,760
chest x-ray her lungs were now perfectly

635
00:32:44,630 --> 00:32:42,450
normal the collapsed lung had totally

636
00:32:48,740 --> 00:32:44,640
expanded with no infiltrate or other

637
00:32:51,380 --> 00:32:48,750
abnormality that existed before and he

638
00:32:55,820 --> 00:32:51,390

said further I have never witnessed

639

00:33:00,200 --> 00:32:55,830

anything like this before since so she

640

00:33:02,240 --> 00:33:00,210

went on to marry Marshall said she's

641

00:33:03,740 --> 00:33:02,250

gone on to live a normal life she

642

00:33:05,380 --> 00:33:03,750

subsequently married a minister and

643

00:33:07,400 --> 00:33:05,390

feels her calling in life

644

00:33:10,910 --> 00:33:07,410

is too

645

00:33:12,830 --> 00:33:10,920

of others now I want to point out to you

646

00:33:15,320 --> 00:33:12,840

that this case has never been written up

647

00:33:17,630 --> 00:33:15,330

in the medical literature and you may

648

00:33:22,550 --> 00:33:17,640

say well this incision this case is so

649

00:33:27,230 --> 00:33:22,560

sensational were they hiding why haven't

650

00:33:32,050 --> 00:33:27,240

we heard about these that would be wrong

651
00:33:35,150 --> 00:33:32,060
they are hiding and we know this because

652
00:33:39,470 --> 00:33:35,160
partly because of this survey by Chellis

653
00:33:43,190 --> 00:33:39,480
and stem that was published in the 1980s

654
00:33:47,540 --> 00:33:43,200
in an analysis of reports of cancer

655
00:33:50,390 --> 00:33:47,550
admission from 1900 to 1987 almost a

656
00:33:53,030 --> 00:33:50,400
century these two researchers found that

657
00:33:56,390 --> 00:33:53,040
quote no physician was willing to risk

658
00:33:59,540 --> 00:33:56,400
his or her reputation by reporting a

659
00:34:04,210 --> 00:33:59,550
case of spontaneous regression he or she

660
00:34:07,730 --> 00:34:04,220
felt was due to a psychological method

661
00:34:10,580 --> 00:34:07,740
so the cases don't get published because

662
00:34:17,830 --> 00:34:10,590
of an epidemic of what I want to call

663
00:34:20,450 --> 00:34:17,840

conceal Ian's interruptus there's hope

664

00:34:25,280 --> 00:34:20,460

the Institute of noetic scientists

665

00:34:29,450 --> 00:34:25,290

published this go to big volume in the

666

00:34:33,040 --> 00:34:29,460

early nineties describing 3,500 cases in

667

00:34:39,350 --> 00:34:33,050

almost any decision you want to imagine

668

00:34:42,380 --> 00:34:39,360

which responded to no therapy or minimal

669

00:34:46,070 --> 00:34:42,390

therapy so the cases are out there if

670

00:34:47,780 --> 00:34:46,080

you go to the trouble to find them candy

671

00:34:49,100 --> 00:34:47,790

Gunther Brown has made our task of

672

00:34:51,770 --> 00:34:49,110

little easier she published this book

673

00:34:53,780 --> 00:34:51,780

recently testing prayer she's a

674

00:34:56,600 --> 00:34:53,790

professor of Religious Studies who has

675

00:34:58,760 --> 00:34:56,610

done healing experiments herself and I

676
00:35:01,670 --> 00:34:58,770
was delighted to stumble upon this two

677
00:35:02,620 --> 00:35:01,680
volumes set called miracles by Craig

678
00:35:05,540 --> 00:35:02,630
keener

679
00:35:07,940 --> 00:35:05,550
this describes thousands of radical

680
00:35:12,130 --> 00:35:07,950
healings worldwide from just about every

681
00:35:15,080 --> 00:35:12,140
religious tradition you want to name

682
00:35:17,420 --> 00:35:15,090
including non-religious sources so if

683
00:35:19,340 --> 00:35:17,430
you are of the opinion that religion and

684
00:35:20,570 --> 00:35:19,350
healing have nothing to do with it with

685
00:35:23,210 --> 00:35:20,580
each other I think

686
00:35:24,380 --> 00:35:23,220
you ought to check this out if you want

687
00:35:30,290 --> 00:35:24,390
to go to the professional literature

688
00:35:33,140 --> 00:35:30,300

here's one excellent study this is these

689

00:35:34,730 --> 00:35:33,150

are meta analyses of non-contact healing

690

00:35:38,000 --> 00:35:34,740

studies that came out of the University

691

00:35:39,920 --> 00:35:38,010

of Northampton by Chris Rowe who spoke

692

00:35:44,060 --> 00:35:39,930

at this conference for what two or three

693

00:35:47,180 --> 00:35:44,070

years ago it involves 200 studies of

694

00:35:50,330 --> 00:35:47,190

distant healing intentionality about

695

00:35:52,550 --> 00:35:50,340

Hathi studies concerned humans whole

696

00:35:55,910 --> 00:35:52,560

human beings about half of them

697

00:35:58,580 --> 00:35:55,920

concerned studies and bacterial cells

698

00:36:00,860 --> 00:35:58,590

animals plants and so on and the

699

00:36:03,620 --> 00:36:00,870

statistical power is slim but it is

700

00:36:05,480 --> 00:36:03,630

statistically significant one reason

701
00:36:08,030 --> 00:36:05,490
it's not more significant is that these

702
00:36:09,890 --> 00:36:08,040
knock-your-socks-off cases like Barbara

703
00:36:13,910 --> 00:36:09,900
Comiskey never get reported in these

704
00:36:17,540 --> 00:36:13,920
kinds of studies now I haven't said

705
00:36:19,370 --> 00:36:17,550
anything about building stones work I

706
00:36:21,500 --> 00:36:19,380
don't want to steal his thunder round he

707
00:36:23,870 --> 00:36:21,510
will be talking about some of the most

708
00:36:28,960 --> 00:36:23,880
significant healing studies that are

709
00:36:32,480 --> 00:36:28,970
going on currently I want to mention I

710
00:36:35,780 --> 00:36:32,490
always put too much on my plate and it's

711
00:36:43,490 --> 00:36:35,790
just just a feeling I can't help it pray

712
00:36:46,400 --> 00:36:43,500
for me one of the things that Wilson

713
00:36:49,550 --> 00:36:46,410

really criticizes in concealed Ian's is

714

00:36:52,070 --> 00:36:49,560

the idea that dreams and reverie and

715

00:36:53,240 --> 00:36:52,080

daydreaming and liminal states of

716

00:36:55,250 --> 00:36:53,250

awareness can tell you anything

717

00:36:56,630 --> 00:36:55,260

worthwhile in science I don't know why

718

00:37:00,020 --> 00:36:56,640

he says it's because the history of

719

00:37:04,490 --> 00:37:00,030

science is chock-full of exceptions

720

00:37:06,050 --> 00:37:04,500

I had a flirtation with this after bill

721

00:37:08,300 --> 00:37:06,060

bingston called me several months ago

722

00:37:11,530 --> 00:37:08,310

and asked me if I would give a talk and

723

00:37:14,450 --> 00:37:11,540

I was hesitant and I didn't answer him

724

00:37:18,670 --> 00:37:14,460

right away and that night I had a dream

725

00:37:23,380 --> 00:37:18,680

and in the dream bill pops up

726

00:37:26,470 --> 00:37:23,390

I don't I don't know why I deserve this

727

00:37:31,930 --> 00:37:26,480

special treatment but bill said you have

728

00:37:35,860 --> 00:37:31,940

to give this talk and I said oh yeah why

729

00:37:37,720 --> 00:37:35,870

do I have to and he said because SSC is

730

00:37:38,200 --> 00:37:37,730

in your name he said how can you get out

731

00:37:51,210 --> 00:37:38,210

of it

732

00:37:59,980 --> 00:37:57,040

thanks Bill I guess so you see what this

733

00:38:02,730 --> 00:37:59,990

dangerous stop be careful with this I

734

00:38:06,730 --> 00:38:02,740

don't have time to go into some of the

735

00:38:11,200 --> 00:38:06,740

dreams that I have I wanted to share

736

00:38:15,430 --> 00:38:11,210

with you which led to Nobel Prizes great

737

00:38:18,880 --> 00:38:15,440

advances Frederick Banting dream about

738

00:38:21,610 --> 00:38:18,890

how to how do you how do you isolate

739

00:38:23,530 --> 00:38:21,620

insulin well he did and he's still the

740

00:38:26,380 --> 00:38:23,540

not youngest Nobel laureate he was

741

00:38:30,970 --> 00:38:26,390

awarded the prize at age 32 calculate

742

00:38:33,160 --> 00:38:30,980

his dream about the cyclic structure of

743

00:38:35,800 --> 00:38:33,170

the benzene molecule

744

00:38:39,910 --> 00:38:35,810

Elias house discovery of the sewing

745

00:38:42,280 --> 00:38:39,920

machine and so I just think there's a

746

00:38:45,490 --> 00:38:42,290

deeper view of conceal Ian's that then

747

00:38:48,520 --> 00:38:45,500

Wilson has left us - I keep coming back

748

00:38:52,450 --> 00:38:48,530

- you can't put it together it is

749

00:38:56,500 --> 00:38:52,460

together so what holds it together and I

750

00:38:59,080 --> 00:38:56,510

think it's consciousness keep coming

751

00:39:00,640 --> 00:38:59,090

back - crapples opinion there is a

752

00:39:02,680 --> 00:39:00,650

terrific book that goes into these

753

00:39:08,830 --> 00:39:02,690

things in case anybody happens to video

754

00:39:10,200 --> 00:39:08,840

instantly so in summary the fundamental

755

00:39:13,300 --> 00:39:10,210

non-local nature of consciousness

756

00:39:17,080 --> 00:39:13,310

constitute each what I consider deep

757

00:39:19,270 --> 00:39:17,090

Concilium or ultimate conciliate the

758

00:39:21,190 --> 00:39:19,280

union of all opposites whose difference

759

00:39:23,860 --> 00:39:21,200

in separation are not fundamental but

760

00:39:27,570 --> 00:39:23,870

only apparent and I close with

761

00:39:31,240 --> 00:39:27,580

quotations from the recent book

762

00:39:32,559 --> 00:39:31,250

transcendental transcendental mine by -

763

00:39:35,579 --> 00:39:32,569

SSA years

764

00:39:38,339 --> 00:39:35,589

amounts Barris and Julianne loss bridge

765

00:39:41,729 --> 00:39:38,349

we are in the midst of a sea change

766

00:39:44,380 --> 00:39:41,739

receding from view is materialism

767

00:39:46,179 --> 00:39:44,390

whereby physical phenomena are assumed

768

00:39:48,999 --> 00:39:46,189

to be primary and consciousness is

769

00:39:51,159 --> 00:39:49,009

regarded as secondary approaching our

770

00:39:53,429 --> 00:39:51,169

insights approaching our sides is a

771

00:39:55,749 --> 00:39:53,439

complete reversal of perspective

772

00:39:58,779 --> 00:39:55,759

according to this alternative view

773

00:40:00,519 --> 00:39:58,789

consciousness is primary and the

774

00:40:04,509 --> 00:40:00,529

physical is secondary

775

00:40:09,009 --> 00:40:04,519

in other words materialism is receding

776

00:40:15,669 --> 00:40:09,019

and giving way to ideas about reality in

777

00:40:24,239 --> 00:40:15,679

which consciousness plays a key role I'm

778

00:40:34,689 --> 00:40:29,649

Thank You Larry so your perspective and

779

00:40:37,199 --> 00:40:34,699

description is beautiful and I wonder we

780

00:40:42,389 --> 00:40:37,209

are at a particular time in history

781

00:40:45,149 --> 00:40:42,399

where were at the end of perhaps

782

00:40:48,189 --> 00:40:45,159

materialistic reductionism and

783

00:40:52,359 --> 00:40:48,199

consciousness is becoming primary again

784

00:40:54,399 --> 00:40:52,369

if we had been standing instead at the

785

00:40:56,529 --> 00:40:54,409

beginning of enlightenment it would have

786

00:40:59,049 --> 00:40:56,539

been just the opposite we would be

787

00:41:01,959 --> 00:40:59,059

putting this archaic consciousness away

788

00:41:04,749 --> 00:41:01,969

and looking at materialism as a way to

789

00:41:05,999 --> 00:41:04,759

understand things and reductionism has

790

00:41:08,589 --> 00:41:06,009

been very successful

791

00:41:12,029 --> 00:41:08,599

technologically at least even though

792

00:41:18,999 --> 00:41:12,039

it's buried other things where is truth

793

00:41:21,309 --> 00:41:19,009

you know we're at one point in history

794

00:41:23,559 --> 00:41:21,319

we think we know the truth a few hundred

795

00:41:25,479 --> 00:41:23,569

years later won't it be different well I

796

00:41:27,939 --> 00:41:25,489

will I'm not sure it will because I'm

797

00:41:30,669 --> 00:41:27,949

not sure we're looking at 200 years in a

798

00:41:37,569 --> 00:41:30,679

feature I think it will be a closer on

799

00:41:41,009 --> 00:41:37,579

thing I I think we may be in for some

800

00:41:44,949 --> 00:41:41,019

surprises that we just don't anticipate

801
00:41:48,159 --> 00:41:44,959
Kingsley Dennis who is a British

802
00:41:51,099 --> 00:41:48,169
philosopher has written wisely about the

803
00:41:54,279 --> 00:41:51,109
fact that we in order to escape the

804
00:41:57,819 --> 00:41:54,289
devastations of runaway materialism may

805
00:42:03,069 --> 00:41:57,829
be headed for a global planet Theory

806
00:42:04,749 --> 00:42:03,079
near-death experience and just as many

807
00:42:08,079 --> 00:42:04,759
people survived a near-death experience

808
00:42:11,859 --> 00:42:08,089
come out of it with a radically altered

809
00:42:15,219 --> 00:42:11,869
new idea about what truth is it may be

810
00:42:19,209 --> 00:42:15,229
that a kind of global shock therapy

811
00:42:24,309 --> 00:42:19,219
might be necessary to save her to save

812
00:42:27,939 --> 00:42:24,319
our species I don't know what's going to

813
00:42:31,839 --> 00:42:27,949

happen I would rely on a comment by

814

00:42:32,559 --> 00:42:31,849

Edward Abbey the monkey wrench gang many

815

00:42:37,449 --> 00:42:32,569

of you probably

816

00:42:41,650 --> 00:42:37,459

and read it over a B he said what is

817

00:42:47,559 --> 00:42:41,660

truth he said I have no idea and I'm

818

00:42:49,839 --> 00:42:47,569

sorry I brought it up great talk

819

00:42:51,729 --> 00:42:49,849

I just want to make a comment positive

820

00:42:53,620 --> 00:42:51,739

comment about what you're saying what a

821

00:42:57,069 --> 00:42:53,630

reluctance about the medical journals to

822

00:43:00,549 --> 00:42:57,079

publish religiosity spirituality of

823

00:43:02,679 --> 00:43:00,559

Medicine I had a fellow who's doing a

824

00:43:04,269 --> 00:43:02,689

neurology fellowship with me and he was

825

00:43:06,909 --> 00:43:04,279

very interested in spirituality and

826

00:43:09,609 --> 00:43:06,919

religiosity and so we did a study

827

00:43:13,059 --> 00:43:09,619

showing that patients with Alzheimer's

828

00:43:15,819 --> 00:43:13,069

disease who were higher on us of rating

829

00:43:18,249 --> 00:43:15,829

of spirituality and private religious

830

00:43:20,890 --> 00:43:18,259

practices we're not going to structured

831

00:43:23,769 --> 00:43:20,900

religion churches and synagogues and

832

00:43:27,609 --> 00:43:23,779

that sort of thing in mosques they we

833

00:43:30,699 --> 00:43:27,619

found that they declined slower and we

834

00:43:32,949 --> 00:43:30,709

submitted that to one of the best widely

835

00:43:35,859 --> 00:43:32,959

read journals in neurology of the world

836

00:43:39,640 --> 00:43:35,869

neurology right and it was accepted so

837

00:43:42,489 --> 00:43:39,650

there you know that reluctance when it

838

00:43:44,979 --> 00:43:42,499

was back in 2007 and we're now trying to

839

00:43:47,169 --> 00:43:44,989

replicate this study yeah in a different

840

00:43:50,799 --> 00:43:47,179

population but certainly in that

841

00:43:54,459 --> 00:43:50,809

neurology Journal that was well I really

842

00:43:57,609 --> 00:43:54,469

appreciate that I am an executive editor

843

00:44:01,209 --> 00:43:57,619

of a medical journal and we encourage

844

00:44:04,509 --> 00:44:01,219

submissions like that and I think the

845

00:44:06,669 --> 00:44:04,519

the tide is turning in in medical

846

00:44:09,249 --> 00:44:06,679

journalism I've had the opportunity to

847

00:44:13,209 --> 00:44:09,259

talk to groups of Harvard physicians

848

00:44:15,909 --> 00:44:13,219

about this weird stuff barbecue miss

849

00:44:18,399 --> 00:44:15,919

keys healing and all that and I recall

850

00:44:19,899 --> 00:44:18,409

one talk I gave to them you know

851

00:44:21,370 --> 00:44:19,909

sometimes it during a talk you think

852

00:44:23,049 --> 00:44:21,380

this is going terribly they're never

853

00:44:26,620 --> 00:44:23,059

going to invite me back and it's all

854

00:44:29,529 --> 00:44:26,630

going to heck but after I made a fool of

855

00:44:32,169 --> 00:44:29,539

myself describing my experiences with

856

00:44:35,769 --> 00:44:32,179

these extraordinary healings in the Q&A

857

00:44:38,409 --> 00:44:35,779

session they begin to share their

858

00:44:40,569 --> 00:44:38,419

experiences with me and so I'm convinced

859

00:44:42,850 --> 00:44:40,579

that you're right below the surface I

860

00:44:45,910 --> 00:44:42,860

think there is a need and a hyung

861

00:44:47,410 --> 00:44:45,920

for physicians to open up and to share

862

00:44:51,220 --> 00:44:47,420

things that they've never told anybody

863

00:44:53,110 --> 00:44:51,230

before almost all of these doctors would

864

00:44:55,270 --> 00:44:53,120

begin their revelations with the same

865

00:44:57,910 --> 00:44:55,280

comment look I've never spoken about

866

00:44:59,830 --> 00:44:57,920

this to anybody but this is what

867

00:45:03,400 --> 00:44:59,840

happened to me and this is what I saw I

868

00:45:06,160 --> 00:45:03,410

think we're we're getting there and I

869

00:45:09,760 --> 00:45:06,170

think part of the reason is because of

870

00:45:15,370 --> 00:45:09,770

organizations like this thank you thank

871

00:45:17,530 --> 00:45:15,380

you thank you for that introduction to

872

00:45:19,810 --> 00:45:17,540

play the devil's advocate a bit it seems

873

00:45:23,470 --> 00:45:19,820

like Concilium is an eval you

874

00:45:25,480 --> 00:45:23,480

competition with another value that most

875

00:45:28,030 --> 00:45:25,490

of us here are operating under and that

876

00:45:30,330 --> 00:45:28,040

the SSC has always operated under and

877

00:45:33,610 --> 00:45:30,340

that is the value of the uncollapse

878

00:45:36,760 --> 00:45:33,620

wavefunction of ambiguity and not

879

00:45:38,860 --> 00:45:36,770

allowing things to rigidify into any

880

00:45:40,990 --> 00:45:38,870

kind of an orthodoxy or any kind of an

881

00:45:45,720 --> 00:45:41,000

ideology however inclusive and diverse

882

00:45:49,810 --> 00:45:45,730

and open and so you know as you said

883

00:45:51,690 --> 00:45:49,820

ambiguity is the way of life and he also

884

00:45:54,550 --> 00:45:51,700

said I'm glad I'm young and not a union

885

00:45:56,440 --> 00:45:54,560

the idea of skeptic of the of the

886

00:45:57,850 --> 00:45:56,450

skeptics where were Greek philosophers

887

00:45:59,380 --> 00:45:57,860

and believed that their powers of

888

00:46:01,720 --> 00:45:59,390

observation and thinking would be

889

00:46:06,460 --> 00:46:01,730

diminished by reaching conclusions and

890

00:46:09,340 --> 00:46:06,470

so if we form akin science which is very

891

00:46:12,730 --> 00:46:09,350

unlikely aren't there great dangers that

892

00:46:15,160 --> 00:46:12,740

the way in which the SSE and that many

893

00:46:17,740 --> 00:46:15,170

of us have conducted our lives could be

894

00:46:20,560 --> 00:46:17,750

diminished by reaching any kind of a

895

00:46:23,800 --> 00:46:20,570

premature consensus oh I'm you agree

896

00:46:25,540 --> 00:46:23,810

totally as far as the SNC is concerned I

897

00:46:27,840 --> 00:46:25,550

have no fears that we're all going to

898

00:46:31,180 --> 00:46:27,850

wind up thinking the same thing

899

00:46:33,070 --> 00:46:31,190

thank you for your comment Thank You